

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA  
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2020-008714

02/02/2023

HONORABLE KATHERINE COOPER

CLERK OF THE COURT  
C. Ladden  
Deputy

GALLERY COMMUNITY ASSOCIATION

PENNY JANE MANSHIP

v.

K HOVNANIAN AT GALLERY L L C, et al.

LOUIS W HOROWITZ

MOHAMAD TOKKO  
JUDGE COOPER

FINAL TRIAL MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE RESET/PRETRIAL DEADLINES  
EXTENDED

East Court Building – Courtroom 711

11:02 a.m. This is the time set for an Informal Status Conference. Plaintiff is represented by counsel, Penny J. Manship. Defendants/Third-Party Plaintiffs K. Hovnanian at Gallery, LLC and K. Hovnanian Arizona Operations, LLC are represented by counsel, Louis Horowitz. Third Party Defendants Desert Vista, Inc. and Renco, LLC are represented by counsel, Mohamad Tokko. All parties are present via Court Connect audio-video platform.

A record of the proceedings is made digitally in lieu of a court reporter.

Discussion is held regarding the parties' pretrial deadlines and the Final Trial Management Conference currently set for February 10, 2023. Counsel request more time to file the Joint Pretrial Statement and submit exhibits and to reset the Final Trial Management Conference.

Based on the foregoing,

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA  
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2020-008714

02/02/2023

**IT IS ORDERED** vacating the Final Trial Management Conference set for February 10, 2023 at 1:30 p.m. and resetting same **to February 24, 2023 at 2:00 p.m. (time allotted: 1 hour)** in this division. All counsel and self-represented parties shall appear **in-person or via Court Connect** before:

**The Honorable Katherine Cooper  
Maricopa County Superior Court  
East Court Building  
101 W. Jefferson  
7th Floor, Courtroom 711  
Phoenix, AZ 85003  
Phone: 602-506-8311**

Court Connect is the Superior Court in Maricopa County's new video court hearing platform. For more information about Court Connect, please visit:  
<https://superiorcourt.maricopa.gov/court-connect>.

**Join on your computer or mobile app**

[Click here to join the meeting](#)

**Or call in (audio only)**

+1 917-781-4590,,860084431# United States, New York City  
Phone Conference ID: 860 084 431#

All persons are strongly urged to appear by video instead of audio alone. For questions, please call Judge Cooper's division at 602.506.8311, or email this division's Courtroom Assistant Brandon Powell at [Brandon.Powell@jbazmc.maricopa.gov](mailto:Brandon.Powell@jbazmc.maricopa.gov) or Judicial Assistant Avery Vaughn at [Avery.Vaughn@jbazmc.maricopa.gov](mailto:Avery.Vaughn@jbazmc.maricopa.gov).

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** extending the deadline to file the Joint Pretrial Statement to **12:00p.m., February 21, 2023**. (See below for instructions.)

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** extending the deadline to submit exhibits to **February 21, 2023**. (See below for instructions.)

The Court notes that there is a pending Motion for Summary Judgment and Motion for Partial Summary Judgment under advisement and will issue a ruling on same as promptly as possible.

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA  
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2020-008714

02/02/2023

11:10 a.m. Matter concludes.

**NOTE:** If/when a party files a pleading within **5 days or less** of a scheduled event, the party should also e-mail same this division's Courtroom Assistant Brandon Powell at [Brandon.Powell@jbazmc.maricopa.gov](mailto:Brandon.Powell@jbazmc.maricopa.gov) or Judicial Assistant Avery Vaughn at [Avery.Vaughn@jbazmc.maricopa.gov](mailto:Avery.Vaughn@jbazmc.maricopa.gov).

**NOTE:** All Court proceedings are recorded digitally and not by a court reporter. Pursuant to Local Rule 2.22, if a party desires a court reporter for any proceeding in which a court reporter is not mandated by Arizona Supreme Court Rule 30, the party must submit a written request to the assigned judicial officer at least ten (10) judicial days in advance of the hearing, and must pay the authorized fee to the Clerk of the Court at least two (2) judicial days before the proceeding. The fee is \$140 for a half-day and \$280 for a full day.

Should you want an unofficial copy (CD) of the proceedings, please email Electronic Records Services at [ERS@superiorcourt.maricopa.gov](mailto:ERS@superiorcourt.maricopa.gov) or call **(602) 506-7100**. Please note that there is a \$30.00 fee. To obtain a copy of a hearing on the day it is conducted, you must first fill out a "Request for Daily Copy" form and pay the fee at the Court's Law Library Resource Center. Forms are available at the Law Library Resource Center. To order transcripts of digitally recorded court proceedings, call Electronic Records Services for instructions.

**DUTIES BEFORE THE FINAL TRIAL MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE**

**JOINT PRETRIAL STATEMENT.** The parties shall file with the Court **no later than 5:00 p.m. on February 21, 2023**, a **Joint Pretrial Statement**, signed by all counsel (and any self-represented party) and containing the following. **This order modifies the requirements of Ariz. R. Civ. P. 16(f).**

1. **List of Claims.** The Joint Pretrial Statement must contain a list of all claims or causes of action on which a verdict is sought by any party. Such list shall specify (1) the cause of action (e.g., breach of contract, negligence, etc.), (2) each party asserting that cause of action, and (3) each party against whom that cause of action is asserted.
2. **No List of Issues.** The Joint Pretrial shall also contain the items listed in Ariz. R. Civ. P. 16(f)(2)(A), (B) and (C). The parties may also, if they wish, submit one or more separate stipulations regarding facts, evidence or other matters.
3. **Summary of the Case for Jury Selection.** The Joint Pretrial Statement must include an agreed-upon brief (generally less than 200 words) summary of the case for jury selection purposes. If the parties cannot agree, they must submit separate proposed summaries.

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA  
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2020-008714

02/02/2023

4. **Final Trial Witnesses.** The Joint Pretrial Statement must include an exhibit entitled Final Trial Witness List (see attached), which must list each witness a party expects to call at trial (in person or by deposition), the estimated time needed for direct, cross, and redirect, and the day on which they expect to call that witness. If the court finds that a party unreasonably included witnesses not likely to be called at trial, it may consider appropriate sanctions.
5. **Trial Exhibits.** As required by Rule 16(f)(E), all trial exhibits must be listed in the Joint Pretrial Statement along with objections. The Court typically resolves objections to exhibits at trial, but objections must be listed in the Joint Pretrial Statement to be preserved. If the Court finds that a party unreasonably included exhibits not likely to be used at trial, it may consider appropriate sanctions.
6. **Deposition Designations.** Deposition designations and objections should not be included in the Joint Pretrial Statement, but must be submitted to the Court three judicial days before the start of trial. The Court will resolve deposition designations as follows: By 4:00 p.m. the day before a party plans to read deposition testimony, that party must provide the Court a hard copy of the deposition transcript with (1) the portions to be read highlighted, (2) any counter-designations highlighted in a different color, and (3) any objections written in the margin. The Court will rule on any objections by the next day. If the party plans to play a video deposition, the transcript must be provided by 4:00 p.m. two days before the deposition will be played.
7. **Other Matters.** The Joint Pretrial Statement must include the matters in Ariz. R. Civ. P. 16(f)(2)(H), (I), (J) and (K).

**JURY INSTRUCTIONS; VOIR DIRE.** The parties shall meet and agree on as many proposed jury instructions as possible. The parties shall file with the Court, with their Joint Pretrial Statement, copies of:

1. Proposed voir dire questions.
2. Agreed-upon preliminary and final jury instructions and proposed forms of verdicts.
3. Separate sets of requested instructions that have not been agreed upon. Recommended Arizona Jury Instructions ("RAJI") may be referred to by name without reprinting, but if the RAJI contains options for the Court the party should indicate which options it is requesting.

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA  
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2020-008714

02/02/2023

Jury instructions not requested by the final trial management conference will be deemed waived unless good cause exists for the untimely request.

**SETTLEMENT.** The parties are reminded to promptly notify the Court of any settlement pursuant to Ariz. R. Civ. P. 5.3(d). One day's jury fees will be assessed unless the Court is notified of settlement before 2:00 p.m. on the judicial day before the trial.

**DUTIES AT TRIAL MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE**

At the final trial management conference, the parties shall be prepared to discuss:

1. The claims and parties as to which a verdict is sought.
2. The length of the trial and any time limits to complete the trial in the allotted time.
3. Any scheduling or equipment issues.
4. Voir dire.
5. Any special issues regarding exhibits or deposition designations.
6. Preliminary jury instructions.
7. The case summary for jury selection purposes.
8. Motions in limine.
9. The potential for settlement before trial.

**TRIAL EXHIBITS**

Counsel (and any self-represented party) **shall deliver all trial exhibits to the Clerk of the Court no later than 3:00 p.m. on February 21, 2023.**

**\*\*PLEASE NOTE: FOR JURY TRIALS, ONLY PAPER EXHIBITS SHALL BE SUBMITTED\*\***

For in-person exhibit submission, please visit, <https://www.clerkofcourt.maricopa.gov/services/exhibits-submission>. The webpage will provide instructions and guidance for locations for in-person submission of exhibits.

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA  
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2020-008714

02/02/2023

For filing paper exhibits, please adhere to the following guidelines:

1. Exhibits will be marked consecutively. *The clerk cannot reserve numbers for exhibits that will be provided at a later date.* Any missing exhibits will not be considered and the numbers of all following exhibits will be moved up. If Defendant's exhibits are received prior to Plaintiff's exhibits, the clerk may mark them first with Plaintiff's exhibits following.
2. Do not place exhibits in a notebook when submitting them to the clerk for marking and do not provide the clerk with stacks of loose paper. **Individual exhibits consisting of multiple pages shall be BOUND BY STAPLES OR TWO-PRONG FASTENERS.** **DO NOT use paper clips, rubber bands, binder clips or submit loose sheets of paper.**
3. Original Depositions will not be marked as an exhibit. **Original** depositions to be used for impeachment purposes shall be provided to the clerk on the first day of trial to be hand-filed.
4. Do not submit duplicate exhibits, **it is essential that the parties confer to avoid submitting duplicate exhibits.**
5. If large charts or blow-ups are anticipated to be used, please include a small version (or photo) which can be marked as the exhibit. The charts and blow-ups are used for demonstrative purpose only, are not marked as the exhibits, and are returned.
6. Do not put numbers on the exhibits themselves; instead, **use a COLORED sheet with the exhibit number on it.** Place the colored sheet in front of each exhibit, however, **DO NOT staple or paper-clip it to the exhibit itself** (this should be the only loose sheet).
7. The parties are to provide a workable list of exhibits. The list should include a title or description of each exhibit. (See blank sample of the following table as a reference).
8. If media files or video-recordings are anticipated to be submitted for marking, please submit them on **thumb-drives**, not on a CD, and deliver them to the division for marking. **If multiple exhibits need to be placed on a thumb drive, please submit separate thumb drives for each individual exhibit so they may be marked as their own exhibit.**

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA  
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2020-008714

02/02/2023

<b>Exhibit No.</b>	<b>Identified By</b>	<b>Description</b> <i>Should be verifiable when viewing the first page of the exhibit</i>	<b>Stipulated in Evidence/Objection</b>

**PLEASE NOTE:** Each party shall provide a binder of exhibits for the Court’s use. Each exhibit shall be separated by numbered divider tabs.

For additional assistance in preparation of exhibits contact the courtroom clerk at:

[Cammille.Ladden@maricopa.gov](mailto:Cammille.Ladden@maricopa.gov).

**NOTICE: Exhibits Marked But Not Offered**

Exhibits submitted to the Court for a hearing/trial, whether through hard copy or submitted electronically, that are marked as exhibits but are not offered into evidence at the hearing/trial will be destroyed following the hearing/trial, unless a party requests that the evidence be returned at the conclusion of the hearing/trial. Such requests must be filed with the Court and served on all parties in advance of the hearing/trial or by no later than the conclusion of the hearing/trial.

**WITNESS INFORMATION FORM**

Allocation time for Jury Selection, Opening Statements, witness examinations, and Closing Argument. You should assume **5 hours** of trial time per day, starting at 9:30am to 4:30 pm with 1.5 hours for lunch and two 15-minute breaks. Closing arguments shall be completed and the case submitted to the jury no later than **2pm** on the last day of trial.

**TOTAL ESTIMATED TRIAL TIME: 15 days.**

**VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION**

TIME ESTIMATE FOR:	
PLAINTIFF(S) VOIR DIRE	
DEFENDANT(S) VOIR DIRE	

**WITNESSES FOR PLAINTIFF(S)**

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA  
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2020-008714

02/02/2023

	WITNESS NAME	DIRECT & RE-DIRECT	CROSS
1			
2			
3			
4			
5			
6			

DIRECT, RE-DIRECT & CROSS TOTAL: \_\_\_\_\_

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA  
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2020-008714

02/02/2023

WITNESSES FOR DEFENDANT(S)

	WITNESS NAME	DIRECT & RE-DIRECT	CROSS
1			
2			
3			
4			
5			
6			

DIRECT, RE-DIRECT & CROSS TOTAL: \_\_\_\_\_

TOTAL WITNESS TIME ESTIMATE: \_\_\_\_\_

TIME ESTIMATE FOR:	PLAINTIFF		DEFENDANT
OPENING STATEMENT			
CLOSING ARGUMENT	1 <sup>st</sup> :	2 <sup>nd</sup> :	