

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA  
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2020-008714

04/26/2023

HONORABLE KATHERINE COOPER

CLERK OF THE COURT

C. Ladden

Deputy

GALLERY COMMUNITY ASSOCIATION

PENNY JANE MANSHIP

v.

K HOVNANIAN AT GALLERY L L C, et al.

LOUIS W HOROWITZ

JASON J BOBLICK  
LEONARD T FINK  
SHANNON G HUFF  
MICHAEL A LUDWIG  
RINA K RAI  
AMY WILKENS  
DENNIS I WILENCHIK  
DOCKET CV TX  
JUDGE COOPER

FINAL JUDGMENT

On February 8, 2023, the Court granted Defendants K. Hovnanian at Gallery, LLC, and K. Hovnanian Arizona Operations, LLC summary judgment and dismissed the Complaint against them. Accordingly, **IT IS ORDERED** entering Judgment in favor of Defendants K. Hovnanian at Gallery, LLC, and K. Hovnanian Arizona Operations, LLC, and against Plaintiff Gallery Community Association.

The February 8, 2023 Ruling in favor of Defendants Hovnanian also resolved the Third-Party Complaint against Third-Party Defendants Renco, LLC dba Renco Roofing and Desert Vista, Inc. as moot.

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA  
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2020-008714

04/26/2023

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** entering Judgment against Plaintiff Gallery Community Association as follows:

1. Defendants K. Hovnanian at Gallery, LLC, and K. Hovnanian Arizona Operations, LLC, are awarded attorneys' fees of \$147,643.47 and taxable costs of \$20,589.06, for a total of **\$168,232.53**, plus interest at the legal rate of 9.0% accruing from the date that this Judgment is entered until paid pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1201(B).
2. Third-Party Defendant Renco LLC dba Renco Roofing is awarded attorneys' fees of \$115,209 and taxable costs of \$4,525.91, for a total of **\$119,734.91**, plus interest at the legal rate of 9.0% accruing from the date that this Judgment is entered until paid pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1201(B).
3. Third-Party Defendant Desert Vista, Inc. is awarded attorneys' fees of \$86,715.50 and taxable costs of \$4,525.92, for a total of **\$91,241.42**, plus interest at the legal rate of 9.0% accruing from the date that this Judgment is entered until paid pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1201(B).

There are no further claims or issues pending in this matter. This Judgment fully resolves the Complaint and Third-Party Complaint and is entered pursuant to Rule 54(c).

Dated this 26th day of April, 2023.

/ s / KATHERINE COOPER

---

KATHERINE COOPER  
JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT