

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2024-003271

12/17/2025

HONORABLE SUSANNA C. PINEDA

CLERK OF THE COURT
T. Williams
Deputy

VAL VISTA CLASSIC COMMUNITY
ASSOCIATION

NIKITA VERMA PATEL

v.

LEVI ROSENBAUM

LEVI ROSENBAUM
1639 E CHELSEA LN
GILBERT AZ 85295

EMBER ANN VAN VRANKEN
JUDGE PINEDA

MINUTE ENTRY

East Court Building – Courtroom 913

9:00 a.m. This is the time set for a Trial Setting Conference. Plaintiff, Val Vista Classic Community Association, is represented by counsel, Ember Ann Van Vranken on behalf of counsel of record, Nikita Verma Patel. Defendant, Levi Rosenbaum is present on his own behalf. All parties appear virtually.

A record of the proceedings is made digitally in lieu of a court reporter.

Discussion is held regarding a Motion for Summary Judgment filed by the Plaintiff on November 18, 2025. Defendant asks the court to provide additional time to respond to the pleading. With no objection,

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2024-003271

12/17/2025

IT IS ORDERED granting Defendant Levi Rosenbaum until **January 22, 2026**, to provide his Response to the Motion for Summary Judgment filed by the Plaintiff.

The Court and counsel discuss the status of the case and setting trial.

IT IS ORDERED setting a virtual Trial Management Conference on **December 11, 2026, at 9:00 a.m. (1 hour allotted)**.

1. Click www.Tinyurl.com/jbazmc-cvj12 or enter it in the browser of your device
2. Enter your full name and role in name field.
3. Wait for the facilitator to admit you to the proceeding (note that you may wait to be admitted and the Court may not be able to communicate with you while you wait).

Self-represented litigants may call in if access to internet is not available.

Phone: +1 917-781-4590

Conference ID: 508 176 593#

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED setting a 2-Day Jury Trial beginning on **January 20, 2027**, before this Division. Scheduled Trial days are Monday through Thursday, **January 20, 2027, through January 21, 2027**. Counsel (and any self-represented party) shall appear at **10:00 a.m.** on all trial days. Trial will promptly commence at 10:00 a.m., with the afternoon session promptly beginning at 1:30 p.m. A fifteen-minute break will be taken mid-afternoon. Trial days will conclude at 4:30 p.m.

HON. SUSANNA PINEDA
Maricopa County Superior Court
East Court Building
101 West Jefferson Street
9th Floor, Courtroom 913
Phoenix, AZ 85003

NOTE: All court proceedings are recorded digitally and not by a court reporter. Pursuant to Local Rule 2.22, if a party desires a court reporter for any proceeding in which a court reporter is not mandated by Arizona Supreme Court Rule 30, the party must submit a written request to the assigned judicial officer at least ten (10) judicial days in advance of the hearing, and must pay the authorized fee to the Clerk of the Court at least two (2) judicial days before the proceeding. The fee is \$140 for a half-day and \$280 for a full day.

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2024-003271

12/17/2025

NOTE REGARDING COURTROOM TECHNOLOGY: Parties who intend to use laptops in conjunction with the courtroom's technology are encouraged to **set up an appointment with the Division's Courtroom Assistant at 602-372-2958.**

9:21 a.m. Matter concludes.

DUTIES PRIOR TO THE TRIAL MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE

1. **MOTIONS IN LIMINE.** All Motions in Limine shall be filed no later than **5:00 p.m. on November 20, 2026**, and such motions must meet the test of *State v. Superior Court*, 108 Ariz. 396, 397; 499 P.2d 152 (1972): The primary purpose of a Motion in Limine is to avoid disclosing to the jury prejudicial matters which may compel a mistrial. See also, Ariz. R. Evid. 103(d). Any written Response to a Motion in Limine shall be filed no later than **5:00 p.m. on (2 weeks after MIL) December 4, 2026.** The Court may rule on Motions in Limine without oral argument. No Replies shall be filed. Prior to filing a Motion in Limine, the parties are to confer and attempt to resolve those issues. The parties shall further certify to the Court the efforts made to resolve those issues before filing a Motion in Limine. The parties must comply with Rule 7.2(a) Ariz.R.Civ.P., prior to filing any Motion in Limine. Any Motion in Limine filed without the movant having first complied with Rule 7.2(a), will be stricken by the Court.
2. **DAUBERT MOTIONS.** The deadline for any Daubert motion or any motion brought under Ariz.R.Evid. 702, is the same as the dispositive motion deadline. Failure to file such a motion by this date shall constitute a waiver of (1) any objection that the expert is not qualified to render expert testimony and (2) any objection that any opinion of the expert should be excluded under Ariz.R.Evid. 702.
3. **JOINT PRETRIAL STATEMENT.** The parties shall **deliver to the trial judge at cvj12@jbazmc.maricopa.gov no later than 5:00 p.m. on December 4, 2026**, a copy of the **Joint Pretrial Statement** signed by all parties.
 - a. **Deposition Summary:** In addition to the information required by Rule 16(f), the parties shall provide to the Court copies of any deposition transcripts to be read to the jury. The offering party will highlight the portions to be read, the other side will highlight Rule 106 additions, and any objections for the court to rule on will be clearly marked in the margin. The parties are encouraged to agree on narrative summaries of deposition testimony, using brief question and answer excerpts only to emphasize very important testimony or to cover areas of testimony that cannot be summarized to the satisfaction of all parties. No stipulation should be unreasonably refused.

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2024-003271

12/17/2025

- b. **Final Trial Witnesses:** In addition to the information required by Rule 16(f), the Joint Pretrial Statement shall include an exhibit titled: **Final Trial Witness List**. This list shall contain the name of each witness a party actually intends to call at trial, the day on which they intend to call each witness and the estimated time needed for direct, cross and re-direct examination.
4. **JURY INSTRUCTIONS; VOIR DIRE QUESTIONS.** The parties shall meet and agree on as many proposed jury instructions as possible. The parties shall deliver to the trial judge, with their Joint Pretrial Statement, copies of:
- a. Proposed voir dire questions.
 - b. A joint set of agreed-upon preliminary and final jury instructions and proposed forms of verdicts.
 - c. Separate sets of requested instructions that have not been agreed upon. Please read *Rosen v. Knaub*, 175 Ariz. 329; 85 P.2d 381 (1993) and the RAJI Civil 6th Statement of Purpose and Approach before preparing requests for non-RAJI instructions.

Recommended Arizona Jury Instructions (RAJI) need not be typed and may be requested in the following manner: RAJI 6th Edition (civil) - Duty of Jurors. Non-RAJI instructions should be typed. Each instruction should cover only one subject.

Any jury instructions not delivered with the Joint Pretrial Statement will be deemed waived by the Court, unless the Court concludes that good cause exists for the untimely submission.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, no later than **5:00 p.m. on January 13, 2027**, the parties shall file a Trial Memorandum setting forth their respective positions and **e-mail same** to CVJ12@JBAZMC.Maricopa.Gov.

PLEASE NOTE: Counsel must notify this Division no later than two business days before trial if a jury is not needed to allow for sufficient notice to the Jury Office. Failure to notify the Court of the need to cancel the jury panel may result in costs being assessed against the parties.

DUTIES AT THE TRIAL MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE

1. At the Trial Management Conference, counsel (and any self-represented party) shall be prepared to discuss:

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2024-003271

12/17/2025

- a) Time limits in voir dire, opening statements, examination of witnesses and closing arguments.
- b) Stipulations for the foundation and authenticity of exhibits.
- c) Preliminary jury instructions, juror notebooks (and shall bring any proposed juror notebooks to the conference), mini opening statements and voir dire.
- d) Agreed-upon deposition summaries and excerpts from deposition transcripts and the editing of any videotaped depositions.
- e) Use of short-trial or summary jury trial.
- f) Any special scheduling or equipment issues.

One day's jury fees will be assessed unless the court is notified of settlement before 2:00 p.m. on the judicial day before the trial. The parties are reminded to promptly notify the court of any settlement pursuant to Rule 5.3(d), Ariz.R.Civ.P.

The dates set forth in this Order are FIRM dates and will not be extended or modified by this Court absent good cause. Lack of preparation will not ordinarily be considered good cause.

PLEASE NOTE: If/when a party files a pleading within **5 business days** of a scheduled event, the party should also e-mail same to the Court's Judicial Assistant and Courtroom Assistant at cvj12@JBAZMC.maricopa.gov.

NOTE: THE PARTIES SHALL UPLOAD AND E-FILE ALL PROPOSED ORDERS IN WORD FORMAT ONLY TO ALLOW FOR POSSIBLE MODIFICATIONS BY THE COURT.

EXHIBIT REQUIREMENTS

IT IS ORDERED that the parties submit any proposed hearing exhibits as follows:

1. **Submit Hearing Exhibits through Case Center.** This division is using Case Center (also known as Case Lines), a statewide electronic exhibit portal. Attorneys must submit exhibits through Case Center; Self-Represented Litigants can request to opt-out of Case Center by contacting the judge's division at **602-372-2958**. Unless otherwise ordered, Exhibits must be submitted at least **5 business days** before the hearing as provided below.

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2024-003271

12/17/2025

2. **Opting Out of Case Center (Self-Represented Litigants only)**. A Self-Represented Litigant may opt out of Case Center no less than **10 calendar days** before the trial/evidentiary hearing (or within 24 hours of being served with notice if the party is served less than 10 calendar days before the evidentiary hearing). The Self-Represented Litigant must email the other Self-Represented Litigants or counsel and the assigned judicial division to notify the court that they are opting out and to request instructions for submitting exhibits. Self-Represented Litigants must comply with the deadline for submitting Exhibits. Each party must make sure the Court has the party's valid current email address. If you do not have an email address, you can obtain a free one through accounts.google.com. Each party must register for Case Center at www.azcourts.gov/digitalevidence. The website has links to training resources that will guide you through uploading exhibits and navigating Case Center. The Clerk of Court will email each party (or their attorney of record) a case-specific Case Center link that the party will use to upload exhibits. For assistance with Case Center invitations only, email the Clerk of Court at COCExhibitQuestions@maricopa.gov. The email subject line should include the case number. The body of the email should include the parties' names, the assigned judge's name, and explain that the sender is requesting help with a Case Center invitation.
3. **Exhibit Format**. Case Center accepts most digital formats (including photographs, PDFs, Word files, audio files, and video files). Case Center automatically numbers the exhibits. Plaintiff/Petitioner's exhibits have an A- prefix (Exhibit A1, A2, etc.) and Defendant/Respondent's exhibits have a B- prefix (Exhibit B1, B2, etc.). During the hearing, the parties must refer to exhibits using the Case Center exhibit numbers. For assistance with Case Center, contact AOC Support Services at (602) 452-3519 (option 5) or pasupport@courts.az.gov, Monday – Friday 7 AM – 6 PM, excluding State holidays.
4. **Exhibit Upload Assistance**. Scanners are available at each of the regional court Law Library Resource Centers. Each scanner has an attached computer and instructions on how to upload exhibits into Case Center.
5. **Exchange Exhibits**. At least **5 business days** (not including weekends) before the hearing, you must give the other party copies of all exhibits you submitted for use at the hearing.

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2024-003271

12/17/2025

6. **Physical Exhibits**. The Courtroom Clerk will handle marking physical exhibits for Self-Represented Litigants who opt out of Case Center. Attorneys who submit physical exhibits must create a placeholder in Case Center and include “Physical Exhibit” in the name of the exhibit prior to submitting the physical exhibit(s) to the judge’s division. The collection of physical exhibits must have a Physical Exhibit Case Coversheet that includes the following: (1) the name of the party submitting the exhibit(s); (2) the case number; (3) the date of hearing; and (4) the exhibit number(s) and description(s). In addition, each individual exhibit must have an Exhibit Coversheet printed on color paper indicating the physical exhibit’s exhibit number in Case Center. For Self-Represented Litigants, if any individual exhibit is a document that is longer than ten (10) pages, each page of the exhibit should be numbered. Division staff will provide the exhibits to the Courtroom Clerk for marking. The Courtroom Clerk will mark physical exhibit(s) with the same exhibit number used in Case Center.

7. **Devices and WiFi**. If needed, hearing participants may request to use a court-provided devices to view and present exhibits during an evidentiary hearing. All requests for access to a court-provided device must be submitted to the division via email **5 calendar days** before the Hearing. Hearing participants can connect to the court’s free MCPUBLIC WiFi for up to 90 minutes. For evidentiary hearings/trials longer than 90 minutes, WiFi users, the parties may request access to MCSponsored WiFi which will allow access to WiFi without the need to reconnect after 90 minutes by emailing the assigned division **10 calendar days** in advance of any Hearing. Self-Represented Litigant access will be valid for 60 days; lawyer and nonlawyer representative access will be valid for 365 days.

8. **Remote Witnesses**. Any party who calls a witness who is appearing remotely (i.e., by telephone or videoconference) should either (1) provide the witness with a copy of all exhibits or (2) ensure that the remote witness has an electronic device available that allows them to view exhibits displayed on a screen through either Case Center or Teams.

9. **Exhibit Presentation During Hearings**. Unless indicated otherwise in any hearing-specific court minute entry or order, offerors may, but are not required to, use Case Center to present (e.g., show to the court, a witness, or the jury) evidence during a Hearing. Options for presentation of evidence include but are not limited to the following: (1) use of paper copies of the exhibits that have been uploaded to Case

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2024-003271

12/17/2025

Center; (2) use of evidence presentation software and/or PDF viewers to display PDFs of exhibits that have been uploaded to Case Center; (3) screen sharing of Case Center through Court Connect (Teams); and (4) use of Case Center “Presentation” mode to share exhibits. Parties are strongly encouraged to download PDFs of their Case Center exhibits and/or have paper copies available in the event there are technological difficulties in the courtroom.

10. **Additional Resources.** For Case Center related training and questions, the parties may wish to visit the Thomson Reuters Case Center Home Page at <https://answers.legalprof.thomsonreuters.com/casecenter-us/search>. For technical issues with Case Center, parties may contact AOC Support Services Monday – Friday from 7:00 AM – 6:00 PM, excluding State holidays, at (602) 452-3519, 1-800-720-7743 (toll free), or pasupport@courts.az.gov. The parties may also wish to review A.O. 2024-080 at <https://superiorcourt.maricopa.gov/media/30ylnjsa/ao2024-080-re-use-of-case-center-in-the-civil-department.pdf> for additional information regarding Case Center.

Self-Represented Litigant Advisory

ATTENTION SELF-REPRESENTED LITIGANTS: Unless an attorney files a notice that he or she represents a party, the person(s) not represented by an attorney will act as his or her own attorney. **The law requires the court to hold all persons representing themselves to the same standard as a licensed attorney.** Self-represented litigants are encouraged to review the Arizona Rules of Civil Procedure, paying particular attention to Rule 26. Please note that **only a licensed attorney may represent a corporation, LLC, or similar business entity in the Superior Court.** *Ramada Inns v. Lane & Bird Advertising*, 102 Ariz. 127, 426 P.2d 395 (1967). You may not file motions or request for relief on behalf of another self-represented party.

Before the judge can consider anything you send her, you must show her that you have given a copy of your request:

1. To the Clerk of the Court. The Clerk of the Court is a separately elected official. It is the clerk’s job to keep an independent record of everything that happens at the court. The court cannot act on a document that has not been made a part of that record; and
2. To every other party involved in the case. This is so all parties have a fair chance to tell the judge what they think before she makes a decision.

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2024-003271

12/17/2025

Because of that, if you want the judge to consider something you send her, you must file the original document with the Clerk of the Superior Court, mail or deliver a copy directly to this division (that is, to the judge, using her specific courtroom address)

HONORABLE JUDGE SUSANNA C. PINEDA
101 W. JEFFERSON
9TH FLOOR, COURTROOM 913
PHOENIX, AZ 85003
602-372-2958

and mail or deliver a copy to all opposing parties. In addition, on each document you must include a signed certificate that says whether you mailed or hand delivered each copy, when you did so, and states the specific people and the specific addresses to which you mailed or hand delivered each copy. If a party is represented by a lawyer, you must send or deliver the copy to the lawyer, not to the party. All proposed orders submitted to this division must include copies of the order with self-addressed, stamped envelopes for all parties/counsel.

Do not mail or send papers for the clerk or other parties to the judge.

If you want to file papers with the Clerk of the Court by mail, please send them to:

Clerk of the Superior Court's Office
Civil File Counter
201 W. Jefferson
Phoenix, AZ 85003

The clerk's guidelines for filing by mail can be found at:

[Civil and Tax Filing | Maricopa County Clerk of Superior Court](#)

If you are not represented by a lawyer you must contact this division immediately and give us a current address, telephone number, and email address. If your address, phone number, or email address changes in the future, you must file a notice of change of address/phone number/email address. That form can be downloaded at no charge from the following website:

<http://www.superiorcourt.maricopa.gov/SuperiorCourt/LawLibraryResourceCenter/>

REFERRAL INFORMATION

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA
MARICOPA COUNTY

CV 2024-003271

12/17/2025

Community Outreach & Education Arizona Attorney General's Office

2005 N Central Ave Phoenix, AZ 85004

(602) 542-2123 (Phoenix)

(800) 352-8431*

*Toll free in AZ (outside Maricopa and Pima counties)

communityservices@azag.gov

Maricopa County Bar Lawyer Referral Service

(602) 257-4434

<https://maricopabar.org/index.cfm?pg=LRSHome>

Community Legal Services

(602) 258-3434

(800) 852-9075

<https://clsaz.org/>

All parties representing themselves must keep the Court updated with name and address changes.

An update form may be downloaded at: https://superiorcourt.maricopa.gov/llrc/fc_gn9/